ASSESSMENT OF INVESTMENT EFFICIENCY IN THE UTLM "UKRTELECOM" SHARES

Valentina M. Andrienko, PhD in Economics, Associate Professor
Odessa National Polytechnic University, Odessa, Ukraine
ORCID: 0000-0002-6137-1441
Email: andrienro.v@gmail.com

Oksana O. Sokolovska
Odessa National Polytechnic University, Odessa, Ukraine
ORCID: 0000-0001-6961-0411
Email: sokol9945@gmail.com
Received 29.05.2019

The article is devoted to the assessment of investment efficiency in the UTLM "UKRTELECOM" shares. Scientific and methodical article.

The article is devoted to the assessment of investment efficiency in the UTLM "UKRTELECOM" shares. Scientific and methodical article.

Effectiveness ratios calculation allows one to identify the most effective and resulting management strategies in the stock market or to review and modify existing ones, as well as minimize the risks of investing in financial instruments. The Ukrtelecom PJSC operates securities on the Ukrainian Stock Market (UX), which is regulated by a securities management group. The company is an emitter of UTLM shares. Therefore, assessment of investment efficiency in the UTLM "UKRTELECOM" shares is a very important task.

Analysis of recent research and publications
At present, there are a fairly large number of research articles, where theoretically and methodologically a wide range of investment management issues are developed. A huge contribution to the scientific views development on this problem was made by U. Sharp, J. Hordon (Sharpe 2007), H. Aleksander (Aleksander 2007), H. Markovitts (Markowitz 1987), P. Samuelson (Samuelson 1972), E. Fama (Fama 1996) [1-4].

The issue of management efficiency of investment activities was investigated by such foreign scientists as V. Berens, L.J. Hitman, M.D. Dzhonk, K. Faltsman, T.S. etc. Research and development of enterprises investment problems was carried out in the domestic scientists’-economists’ researches: V.M. Khobta, A.M. Yastremska, V.M. Hrynova [5-7].
Y.A. Blank, N.M. Huliaieva, A.A. Peresada, Y.V. Danylenko, A.V. Haidutskyi, A. Muzychenko, O.K. Drahan, V.H. Fedorenko and others.

But the assessment problem of the investment efficiency in stock market instruments is quite complex, and existing methodological approaches do not sufficiently take into account the realities of economic globalization. Therefore, research in this field is continuing.

The aim of the article is assessment of investment efficiency in the UTLM "UKRTELECOM" shares in the current conditions.

The main part

The proper shares selection for investing involves preliminary analysis of the emitter company. The ultimate goal of such an analysis is to determine the investment attractiveness degree of the analyzed company. The accounting balance sheet figures allow an investor to answer the question of whether to invest in its shares and what risk it may entail [8].

Tab. 1 shows the accounting balance sheet figures dynamics for 2015-2017 by PJSC "Ukrtelecom", which should be used in the analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Current assets (UAH)</td>
<td>12 062 877</td>
<td>13 001 245</td>
<td>14 343 372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-current assets (UAH)</td>
<td>9 312 347</td>
<td>9 744 054</td>
<td>10 044 043</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed assets (UAH)</td>
<td>8 983 451</td>
<td>8 839 758</td>
<td>8 965 922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reserves amount (UAH)</td>
<td>120 564</td>
<td>143 940</td>
<td>136 143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accounts Receivable (UAH)</td>
<td>1 323 393</td>
<td>1 401 834</td>
<td>1 594 836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount of current liabilities (UAH)</td>
<td>2 295 526</td>
<td>2 729 547</td>
<td>3 916 094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity (UAH)</td>
<td>8 374 773</td>
<td>9 277 207</td>
<td>8 866 891</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: own elaborations*

From the tab. 1 it can be seen that a number of indicators show now growth, then a decrease, for example, equity. The stockholders’ equity determines the share capital dynamics, and the share capital is an indicator of the company’s successful work. If there are no additional issues of shares, then along with the share capital growth, the profit per share increases. The change in tendencies is due to the fact that today the influence of both the negative (the situation around the change of owner) and the positive factors of the activity of PJSC "Ukrtelecom" has increased. Therefore, the company has some problems, the risks of investing in its shares fluctuate greatly. But the gradual growth of current and non-current assets is a positive sign.

Fig. 1 shows the daily prices graph of UTLM shares for 2015-2017 at the close of trading, and in tab. 2 – the result of stock.

![UTLM SharePrice Graph](image)

*Source: own elaboration*

The graph shows that the stock price trend was constantly changing, and in late 2017 one can see a slow growth. The positive dynamics of the EBITDA indicator from tab. 2 shows that there is a demand for Ukrtelecom securities on the UX market.

The graph shows the stock price trend was constantly changing, and in late 2017 one can see a slow growth. The positive dynamics of the EBITDA indicator from tab. 2 shows that there is a demand for Ukrtelecom securities on the UX market.

Table 2. Ukrtelecom exchange activities result

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revenue mln. UAH</td>
<td>6749.3</td>
<td>6767.47</td>
<td>6947.52</td>
<td>6433.15</td>
<td>6530.73</td>
<td>6394.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue from %</td>
<td>-1.77%</td>
<td>0.27%</td>
<td>2.66%</td>
<td>-7.4%</td>
<td>1.52%</td>
<td>6.77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBITDA mln. UAH</td>
<td>1315.23</td>
<td>1654.99</td>
<td>1695.84</td>
<td>1393.87</td>
<td>1391.91</td>
<td>1486.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profitability by EBITDA, %</td>
<td>19.49%</td>
<td>24.46%</td>
<td>24.41%</td>
<td>20.89%</td>
<td>21.31%</td>
<td>23.24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net profit mln. UAH</td>
<td>-258.77</td>
<td>-136.59</td>
<td>366.8</td>
<td>84.73</td>
<td>238.08</td>
<td>444.72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Continuation of the Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Profitability, %</td>
<td>-3.83%</td>
<td>-2.02%</td>
<td>5.28%</td>
<td>1.32%</td>
<td>3.65%</td>
<td>6.95%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P/S</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P/E</td>
<td>-39.37</td>
<td>-60.75</td>
<td>8.17</td>
<td>24.31</td>
<td>11.96</td>
<td>5.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV/EBITDA</td>
<td>9.88</td>
<td>6.61</td>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td>2.69</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own elaboration

The multipliers meaning listed in the table is:
- EBITDA – Earnings Before Interest, Tax, Depreciation, and Amortization;
- P/E = price/earnings ratio or price-to-earnings ratio: a company’s share price in relation to its profits;
- EV/EBITDA = embedded value/ EBITDA. An indicator that compares the value of an enterprise with its EBITDA. Used to estimate the payback period of an investment.

When analyzing a company for the purpose of investing in its shares, one analyzes the ratios of investment efficiency, which can be divided into two groups: absolute and relative [1]. The key indicators in the analysis are risk and profitability. The table below shows the ratios classification by different groups: the indicator type and the estimate nature [8].

Table 3. The Indicators Classification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ratios</th>
<th>The indicator type</th>
<th>The nature of the assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arithmetic average yield</td>
<td>Profitability</td>
<td>Relative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard deviation</td>
<td>Risk</td>
<td>Absolute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharpe ratio</td>
<td>Profitability/ Risk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treynor ratio</td>
<td>Profitability/ Risk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beta Ratio</td>
<td>Risk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alpha Jensen Ratio</td>
<td>Profitability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modiliani Ratio</td>
<td>Profitability/ Risk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own elaboration

Profitability is the most important investment indicator (shares, bonds, futures, etc.). The relative share profitability (as a percentage) at the moment Time t is based on the following formula:

$$ R_t = \ln \left( \frac{A_t}{A_{t-1}} \right) \times 100, \quad t = \frac{n}{2}, $$

where $i$ – the asset price, respectively, at time t and the previous moment t-1 is the number of days.

The Ukrtelecom (UTLM) share profitability estimate was calculated based on daily stock price data at the close of trading. The simplest way to predict stock returns is to use mathematical expectation. To estimate the future (expected) relative price ratio $r_i$, stocks use the arithmetic mean of past returns $R_i$. In this case $r_i = 10\%$.

UTLM share risk assessment. The share risk implies its volatility $\sigma$, (this interpretation was introduced by G. Markowitz). That is, the more sensitive the quotes change, the higher the share risk. In order to calculate the risk, it is necessary to calculate the share profitability standard deviation $R_i$ from the average $r_i$, we get $\sigma = 11\%$.

Fig. 2 shows the UTLM share profitability graph. One can see from the figure that volatility is clearly time-dependent, i.e., high volatility periods alternate with quieter periods when volatility is relatively small. Such a combination of these properties is a characteristic feature of the financial series. This situation is called "volatility clustering" or "heteroskedasticity effect" and indicates a high probability of extreme values occurrence.

![Fig. 2. The UTLM share profitability graph](Source: own elaboration)
The next indicator.Sharp ratio – is the most common stock market investment performance ratio, introduced by the economist W. Sharp in 1966. This ratio is used to analyze stocks, futures, investment portfolios, strategies. Sharp ratio shows the relation of return to investment risk. The formula for the Sharpe ratio calculation is as follows [9]:

$$\text{Sharpe ratio} = \frac{r_p - r_f}{\sigma_p},$$  \hspace{1cm} (2)

where $r_p$ – average share profitability

$r_f$ – average risk-free asset return

$\sigma_p$ – standard share deviation (share risk).

Sharp ratio shows the relation of return on investment to risk. The economic sense of the ratio is that an investor needs to get a return higher than the minimum level, otherwise the investment is meaningless, so the share profitability and the risk-free asset are compared. By the risk-free return on the asset, in practice, take:

- profitability on the bank deposit of the most reliable banks;
- profitability on government securities (e.g. bonds);
- the NBU key interest rate size.

Let’s consider the Sharp ratio analysis in more detail. The table below provides the investments analysis based on Sharp’s metric, depending on its value.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ratio value</th>
<th>Efficiency assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sharp ratio $&gt;1$</td>
<td>High degree of efficiency: investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$0 &lt; \text{Sharp ratio} &lt; 1$</td>
<td>The investing risk level in this investment is higher than its profitability level. Investing is not rational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharp ratio $&lt;0$</td>
<td>Investment is not rational because the return level on an investment is less than the level of return on a risk-free asset</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: own elaboration*

For the average return on a risk-free asset, let’s take the return rate on bonds of Raiffeisen Bank in Ukraine, which is 12.7% per annum. Then the average return on a risk-free asset is $r_f = 12.7 / 242 = 0.06%$. This value corresponds to the average profitability on bonds (12.7%) divided by the number of trading days in the year (there were 200 trading days in 2015-2017).

Sharp ratio comprises Sharp ratio $= 0.09$. That is, according to the table, we can conclude that the investing risk level in this investment is higher than the expected level profitability. Beta ratio – shows the sensitivity of a stock’s return on the market’s profitability (market index). This ratio is used both individually and in the Capital Assets Price Model (CAPM). The beta ratio reflects the systematic investment risk. The formula for calculating the beta ratio is following [9]:

$$\beta = \frac{\text{cov}(r_p, r_m)}{\sigma_m^2},$$  \hspace{1cm} (3)

where: $\beta$ – Beta ratio

$r_p$ – average share profitability

$r_m$ - average market profitability

$\sigma_m^2$ – of market profitability dispersion

$\text{cov}(r_p, r_m)$ – covariance between share profitability and market profitability.

For the market profitability $r_m$ one takes the stock index profitability. Tab. 3 shows the investment analysis in the stock market by $\beta$ ratio. The higher the indicator value, the higher the possible profitability, but at the same time the risk is higher. The coefficient sign reflects the direction of change in the investment profitability. Positive value $\beta$ indicates that changes in market profitability and investment move in the same direction, and negative – in the opposite direction.

According to this data $r_m = 0.13%$, $\sigma_m^2 = 7.84$, a $\text{cov}(r_p, r_m) = 0.071$. The beta ratio for UTLM is $\beta = 0.009$, which indicates the low level of market risk for this investment. Investor strategy is conservative.

Table 3. Investment efficiency assessment by Ratio $\beta$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ratio value</th>
<th>Share risk level</th>
<th>Investor strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$\beta &gt; 1$</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Agressive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\beta = 1$</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Passive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$-1 &lt; \beta &lt; 1$</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Conservative</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: own elaboration*

Treynor ratio shows the relation of exceeding investment profitability over its systematic risk. To assess systematic risk, the market risk value is used, which is calculated as the beta ratio. The beta
ratio reflects the sensitivity of changes in investment profitability and market profitability (market index). The Trainor metric is used by many investment companies to rank the financial product management quality. The calculation formula is following [9].

\[
\text{Treynor ratio} = \frac{r_p - r_f}{\beta_p}, \quad (4)
\]

where: \(r_p\) – average share profitability;

\(r_f\) – average risk-free asset return;

\(\beta_p\) – stock market risk calculated by the formula (3).

This indicator reflects the relationship between the share profitability excess and its market risk. The higher this indicator value, the more effective the investment (tab.4).

**Table 4. Investment efficiency assessment by Treynor ratio**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ratio value</th>
<th>Efficiency assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Treynor ratio &gt; 0</td>
<td>The higher this indicator value the more effective the investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treynor ratio &lt; 0</td>
<td>If (r_p &lt; r_f) , a (\beta_p &gt; 0), it means that investment is not advisable. If (r_p &gt; r_f), a (\beta_p &lt; 0), it means that investment is efficient.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** own elaboration

The Treynor ratio comprises 0.13, that indicates that the investment market risk can be considered acceptable, i.e. investing in UTLM shares may seem effective.

The investments efficiency assessment problem in stock market instruments is rather complicated, existing methodological approaches do not adequately take into account the economic globalization realities. Therefore, research in this field is currently being continued.

The ratios efficiency calculation allows to allocate the most effective management strategies in the stock market, or to revise and modify existing ones, as well as to minimize the investing risks in financial instruments. PJSC "Ukrtelecom" operates with securities on the Ukrainian stock market (UX), which is regulated by the securities management group. The company is an UTLM shares issuer. Therefore, the UTLM investment efficiency evaluation is a very important task for a company.

The article is devoted to the assessment of investment efficiency in the UTLM "UKRTELECOM". The statistical data of the balance sheet and the prices of UTLM shares for the period 2015-2017 are used. The article analysis of the balance sheet was carried out on the basis of which the company’s investment attractiveness was estimated. The company’s share dynamics capital does not show stable growth; in this case, the investment risks in its shares are greatly increasing. But the company has a gradually increasing assets amount, so one can assume that it has a prospect of development.

An analysis of the company’s stock exchange activity has also been carried out. The company’s activity in Ukraine’s stock market in recent years is characterized by the positive dynamics of the EBITDA multiplier. This indicates that the share price is slowly rising, so there is a demand for Ukrtelecom securities on the UX market.

Calculated and analyzed in terms of profitability and risk, the following efficiency ratios investment in UTLM shares are: shares profitability and volatility, Sharp, Beta and Treynor ratios. It is shown that at this time interval the investment risks are less than the shares yield. It was also found that there is a volatility clustering of shares profitability, indicating the possibility of dramatic upturns.

That is, it can be stated that efficiency cannot be calculated accurately, since it depends on the unknown shares sale rate in future. At the same time, it makes sense to have a comprehensive analysis because it gives the opportunity to look at the same situation from different positions and choose the most appropriate action course.

References:


Посилання на статтю:

Reference a Journal Article: